

**ANALISIS KESESUAIAN BUKU PELAJARAN BAHASA INGGRIS UNTUK
SISWA KELAS TUJUH MTs. BARANA**

***AN ANALYSIS OF ENGLISH TEXTBOOK SUITABILITY FOR THE
SEVENTH GRADE STUDENTS AT MTs. BARANA***

Sri Nurnaningsih Ali¹, Syarifuddin Dollah², La Sunra³

^{1,2,3} Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris, Universitas Negeri Makassar, Makassar, Indonesia
Email: syarifuddindollah@unm.ac.id

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received March 15, 2024

Revised April 6, 2024

Accepted April 04, 2024

Available Online April 15, 2024

Kata Kunci:

Analisis, Buku Teks, Evaluasi,
Kesesuaian

Keywords:

*Analysis, Textbook, Evaluation,
Suitability*

ABSTRAK

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengevaluasi kesesuaian buku teks bahasa Inggris yang digunakan di MTs. Barana dengan standar buku ajar yang baik. Penelitian ini menggunakan desain penelitian deskriptif kualitatif dengan buku teks bahasa Inggris untuk kelas 7 SMP, dan seorang guru bahasa Inggris sebagai subjek dalam penelitian ini. Dalam pengumpulan data, instrumen penelitian dalam penelitian ini adalah wawancara dan checklist. Wawancara dilakukan dengan guru bahasa Inggris untuk mendapatkan informasi mengenai kelayakan buku teks bahasa Inggris. Peneliti menemukan bahwa berdasarkan hasil evaluasi buku teks, dari empat kategori standar buku teks yang baik, (1) terdapat satu kategori untuk buku teks 1 "When English Rings a Bell" yang memiliki nilai rendah yaitu kesesuaian grafik, khususnya untuk bagian penutup buku teks, mendapat skor persentase 60% (netral). (2) Pada buku ajar 2 "Bahasa Inggris untuk Nusantara" hanya terdapat satu kategori yang mempunyai skor rendah yaitu kesesuaian grafik khususnya pada bagian penutup buku teks dengan persentase skor sebesar 78,7% (sesuai). Secara keseluruhan, dilihat dari kebutuhan siswa terhadap buku teks bahasa Inggris, buku teks 2 lebih sesuai dengan kebutuhan mereka dibandingkan buku teks 1.

ABSTRACT

This research aims to evaluate the suitability of English textbooks used at MTs. Barana with standards of a good textbook. This research used a qualitative descriptive research design with an English textbook for grade 7 of Junior High School, and an English teacher as the subject in this research. In collecting the data, the research instruments in this research were interviews and checklists. The interview was conducted with the English teacher to gain information regarding the appropriateness of the English textbook. The researcher found that, based on the textbook evaluation results, from four standard categories of a good textbook, (1) there was one category for textbook 1 "When English Rings a Bell" that had low scores, namely graph suitability, especially for the textbook concluding part, get 60% (neutral) score of percentage. (2) There was only one category for textbook 2 "English for Nusantara" that had a low score, namely the graph suitability, especially in the textbook concluding part, with a percentage score of 78.7% (appropriate). Overall, in terms of students' needs for English textbooks, textbook 2 was more suitable for their needs than textbook 1.

INTRODUCTION

There are several kinds of learning materials and one of them is textbooks. Textbooks are extensively utilized as learning resources, particularly in country such as Indonesia. Textbooks are essential in the Indonesian educational system because they contain the teaching materials and practices designed by the Indonesian Minister of Education and Culture. These are expressed through a syllabus and used as primary learning tools in the classroom. According to Septiana, et. al (2020) students in the classroom may learn from the textbook in an effective and interesting way.

Textbooks help to simplify the process of providing educational materials to teachers, eliminating the need for educators to spend unnecessary time for content preparation. Thus, textbooks are commonly regarded as the fundamental source of learning, as confirmed by Ratmanida and Suryanti (2020) who stated that textbooks developed by the government are designed to be widely adopted as the primary educational references in schools. Furthermore, textbooks are commonly used in English lesson at schools. As is widely recognized the inclusion of English in the school curriculum is not a new thing, especially in a country like Indonesia, where English instruction is integrated from primary school to higher education. Additionally, the textbook was equally focused on four competencies and matched with the Indonesian curriculum (Muzakky and Albiansyah, 2021).

There have been several English textbooks published that English teachers can use. However, not all textbooks match the requirements and are in accordance with the educational curriculum implemented in schools. As a result, teachers must be more cautious in selecting English textbook that will be employed to students as learning materials. They must thoroughly examine textbook contents before choosing acceptable material, comparing it to students' needs and its suitability to the curriculum being implemented.

Aside from that, some researchers criticize the widespread utilization of textbooks in English classes. According to Richard (2001) many textbooks lack authentic language which does not reflect how the target language is actually used. Furthermore, the opponents of textbooks claimed that textbooks can weaken both teachers and students, they cannot fulfill the needs and wants of users, they are primarily used to maintain control and order (Tomlinson, 2012). Additionally, Alhamami & Ahmad (2018) evaluated forty-three Saudi EFL (English as Foreign Language) instructors perceptions about textbook in EFL classes. The participants had negative attitudes regarding the textbooks because they did not satisfy the needs of EFL learners, the learning objectives of the courses, or aid students in raising their proficiency level.

It is very important to evaluate a textbook used at school whether it is suitable to be utilized in a particular school and also identify students' needs in learning English particularly in textbooks. Activities carried out to evaluate a textbook are known as textbook evaluation and activities to determine the needs of a group of students in learning English are called needs analysis (Morales, et al., 2010). Although the concept of need analysis is widely employed in English for Specific Purposes (ESP) which includes areas such as professional and academic English, but it can also be applied to general language learning needs, also known as English General Purposes (EGP). As Richards (2001) investigates the concept of a needs analysis, it does not just focus on ESP and vocational programs, but also at all types of English language learning, including regular English classes for kids in elementary school and also English classes in junior and senior high schools. However, need analysis is still rarely used in general purposes. It is suggested by Brown (1995) that formally conducting a need analysis for general language learning is relatively new, yet teachers have been informally assessing their students' language needs for many years to determine what language areas should be taught (Sihmirmo, 2015, p. 42).

METHOD

In this research, the researcher used descriptive qualitative design. Document analysis was used to evaluate the document, in this case English textbook entitled "When English Rings a Bell" that was a textbook used at Mts. Barana and also another textbook namely "English for Nusantara". The primary objective of this research is to explain the suitability of English textbook used for the seventh-grade students in MTs. Barana. This research was conducted at MTs. (Madrasah Tsanawiyah) Barana. It was located on Jl. Ibrahim Tiro Kel. Bulujaya Kec. Bangkala Barat Kab. Jeneponto.

The subject of the research was an English teacher who was interviewed and assisted the researcher to evaluate the English textbook. The criteria for teacher who was used as the subject was English teacher at MTs. Barana that use or had used an English textbook entitled "When English Rings a Bell" for seventh grade of junior high school, and teacher who was willing to spend time and provided information. In this research, the researcher used two Instruments they were interview and checklist to obtain the data.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

Findings

This section presents the findings of the research. To find out the improvement of students' writing skills, researchers used a writing test as an instrument to measure. There were two tests carried out, namely pre-test and post-test. The test was given to both classes, namely the experimental class and the control class. The following are the results of data analysis

The Rate Percentage of Experimental Class and Control Class

Table 1. The Rate Percentage of Experimental Class in Pre-Test and Post Test

No.	Classification	Score	Pre-Test		Post-Test	
			F	P	F	P
1.	Excellent	83-100	0	0	2	10
2.	Good	66-82	0	0	16	76
3.	Fair	49-65	12	57	3	14
4.	Poor	32-48	9	43	0	0
Total			21	100	21	100

The evaluation of English textbook is divided into four categories based on BSNP and Mukundan et. al (2011) categories of a good textbook, namely content suitability, presentation suitability, language suitability and graph suitability or also known as anatomy components of a book. Furthermore, some categories are also divided to sub-aspect. The first, content suitability is divided into four aspects, namely the compatibility of materials with core competence and basic competence, the accuracy of materials, supporting materials as well as teaching and learning context. And the second, graph suitability is divided into two aspects, namely organizing the textbook introductory part and organizing the textbook concluding part. This checklist is evaluated by two evaluators namely the English teacher as evaluator 1 and the researcher as evaluator 2.

Content Suitability

Table 1. The Content Suitability

Point	No.	Criteria	Score (Textbook 1)		Score (Textbook 2)	
			Evaluator 1	Evaluator 2	Evaluator 1	Evaluator 2
It matches with the specification of syllabus	1	Material relevance: the textbook includes material that aligns with the English language curriculum content established by the educational institution.	4	4	4	4
	2	Each unit or chapter in the textbook covers topics or skills that have been specified in the curriculum	4	4	4	4
Social function	3	The text must perform social functions that are related to the students' daily lives such as how to express thoughts, ask information, provide and get instructions effectively in a various social context.	4	4	4	4
	4	The text must conform the typical pattern followed by a specific type of text or communication.	4	4	4	4
Linguistic feature	5	The language used in each text is accurate and suitable, as well as relevant to the current communicative environment and text type.	3	4	4	4

Up-to-datedness	6	The learning resources (texts, tables, images, attachments, etc.) for each text type are based on current and relevant references to the topic.	3	3	4	4
Development of life skills	7	Each text and communicative action encourage students to do various activities to build their life skills, including personal, social, academic skill, etc.	4	4	4	4
Diversity insight	8	Textbook emphasize awareness for cultural diversity and complex societies, which cover a wide range of cultural values as well as local, national and global topics.	3	4	4	4
Listening	9	The textbook has appropriate listening tasks with well-defined goals	3	0	4	4
Speaking	10	Speaking activities are balanced between individual response, pair work and group work	4	2	4	3
Reading	11	The reading texts are interesting	4	4	4	4
Writing	12	The writing tasks have achievable goals and take into consideration learner capabilities	4	4	4	4
Vocabulary	13	An adequate vocabulary list or glossary is included	0	0	4	4
Grammar	14	Grammar is introducing explicitly	0	1	4	4
Pronunciation	15	Pronunciation is contextualized	1	2	3	3
Exercises	16	The exercises incorporate individual, pair and group work.	4	3	4	4
Total Score			49	47	63	62
Percentage			75% (Appropriate)		97.6% (Absolutely appropriate)	

Table 1 shows that the English textbook 2 entitled “English for Nusantara” achieve a high score with the percentage 97.6% (Absolutely appropriate) while the textbook 1 entitled “When English Rings a Bell” get 75% (Appropriate). This shows that the two textbooks are in the very suitable category in terms of the suitability of the material with basic and core competencies. Judging from the accuracy of the material, namely social function, generic structure, and linguistic characteristics, the two books also meet the criteria for good material. The researcher also reviewed the supporting material in terms of current affairs, development of life skills, and diversity of insight and the two books are also suitable in this aspect. However, in the context of teaching and learning which includes several things, namely listening, speaking, reading, writing, vocabulary, grammar, pronunciation and practice, textbook 1 does not fulfill several aspects such as listening, vocabulary, grammar and pronunciation. On the other hand, textbook 2 already covers these things.

Presentation Suitability

Table 2. Technique of presentation

Point	No.	Criteria	Score (Textbook 1)		Score (Textbook 2)	
			Evaluator 1	Evaluator 2	Evaluator 1	Evaluator 2
Systematization	1	The material is presented systematically, starting	4	4	4	4

			from the introduction, body, and closing.				
Balance of chapters and units	2		Cover design, book content design, illustrations, and infographics are relevant to the book's content in each chapter.	4	4	4	4
Total Score				8	8	8	8
Percentage				100% (Absolutely appropriate)		100% (Absolutely appropriate)	

Table 2 shows the result of presentation technique evaluation of the English textbook. The technique of presentation is divided into two points, namely systematization and balance of chapters and units. Both of the textbooks get a high score of percentage that is 100% and they are classified as absolutely appropriate with a standard of a good textbook in terms of presentation.

Language Suitability

Table 3. The use of language in accordance with students' level

Point	No.	Criteria	Score (Textbook 1)		Score (Textbook 2)	
			Evaluator 1	Evaluator 2	Evaluator 1	Evaluator 2
Appropriateness of the language	1	Language appropriateness with learners' development	4	4	4	4
	2	The language used in the message is good, clear and easily-understood by the students.	3	4	3	4
Total Score			7	8	7	8
Percentage			93.7% (Absolutely appropriate)		93.7% (Absolutely appropriate)	

Table 3 shows the appropriateness of the language in the English textbook for the level of students at MTs. Barana. From the result above, both of the textbooks, namely When English Rings a Bell (Textbook 1) and English for Nusantara (Textbook 2) receive the same percentage score of 94% and both fall into absolutely appropriate category. It indicates that the language used in the textbook 1 and textbook 2 are suite with students' development and easy to understand.

Graph Suitability or Anatomy Components of a Textbook

Table 4. Organizing the textbook introductory and concluding part

Point	No.	Criteria	Score (Textbook 1)		Score (Textbook 2)	
			Evaluator 1	Evaluator 2	Evaluator 1	Evaluator 2
Opening	1	The textbook contains a complete title page	4	4	4	4
	2	The textbook contains a publication information page	4	4	4	4
	3	The textbook contains a table of contents page	4	4	4	4
	4	The textbook contains a page of instruction for using the book	0	0	4	4
	5	The textbook includes page numbers	4	4	4	4

Closing	6	The textbook contains a glossary page	0	0	0	0
	7	The textbook contains a bibliography page	4	4	4	4
	8	The textbook contains a list of image page	0	0	3	4
	9	The book contains an index page	0	0	0	0
	10	The book includes pages containing the author biographical information	4	4	4	4
Total Score			24	24	31	32
Percentage			60% (Neutral)		78.7% (Appropriate)	

Table 4 shows that the results of textbook evaluation in terms of textbook organization for textbook 1 entitled *When English Rings a Bell* and textbook 2 entitled *English for the Archipelago* obtained different percentage scores. Textbook 1 only reaches 60% and is classified in the neutral category because there are still many points that are not fulfilled by textbook 1, namely the book's user manual page, does not contain a glossary page, picture list page, and index page. Meanwhile, textbook 2 received a score percentage of 78.7% and it was included in the appropriate category. This score was obtained because textbook 2 did not contain a glossary page and index page.

Discussions

This section interprets the findings from the preceding section. The present research had a single objective, it was to explain the suitability of English textbook used for the seventh grades students at MTs. Barana. To evaluate an English textbook, the researcher utilizes BSNP (Badan Standar Nasional Pendidikan) and Mukundan et. al (2011) theory which divide materials evaluation into three types, namely pre-use evaluation, in-use evaluation and post-use evaluation, especially for this researcher, the researcher conducted pre-use evaluation and in-use evaluation of English textbook. Pre-use evaluation is an evaluation of textbook before it was used at school and in-use evaluation is an evaluation of textbook used at school.

Evaluation of suitability of English textbooks at 7th grade in MTs. Barana use a combination of criteria from Mukundan et. al (2011) and BSNP (Badan Standar Nasional Pendidikan) that provide a comprehensive overview of the quality of a good textbook. It describes how the textbook meet and do not meet the criteria for fulfilment based on the aforementioned result above. There are four categories of textbook evaluation. They are content suitability, presentation suitability, language suitability and graph suitability or anatomy components of a book.

For the first is content suitability. This category has four aspects namely the compatibility of materials with core competence and basic competence, the accuracy of materials, supporting materials and teaching and learning context. From the result of evaluating the textbook, it is found that for the textbook 1, the content suitability including "the compatibility of materials with core competence and basic competence", "the accuracy of materials" and "supporting materials" aspects achieved a score percentage of 75% (appropriate). Whereas the textbook 2 achieve a percentage score in all aspects that are 97.6% (absolutely appropriate). It is indicating that English textbook entitled "*When English Rings a Bell*" (Textbook 1) that has eight chapters and English textbook entitled "*English for Nusantara*" (Textbook 2) that had five chapters including chapter 0 as the first lesson in the textbook, both of the textbook include material that aligned with the English language curriculum content established by educational institution. In addition, each unit or chapter in the textbook covers the topics or skills that have been specified in the curriculum.

However, especially for textbook 1 "*When English Rings a Bell*", the teacher who use the English textbook has to prepare other materials resources for the students because the aspect of teaching and learning context. It needs further attention before choosing the materials will be taught.

For the second is presentation suitability. It is about the technique of presentation. For this aspect, both of the textbook 1 '*When English Rings a Bell*' and textbook 2 '*English for Nusantara*' achieve a maximum percentage of 100% (absolutely appropriate). It indicates that the materials in both textbooks have presented systematically starting from the introduction, body and closing. In addition, all the content and illustration are relevant in each chapter.

The next is language suitability. The result of evaluation found that both the textbook 1 '*When English Rings a Bell*' and textbook 2 '*English for Nusantara*' get the same percentage score of 93.7% (absolutely appropriate). It shows that both of them have appropriated with the criteria of a good textbook

in the context of the language in use. In addition, it also indicates that the use of language in textbook 1 and textbook 2 appropriate with the learners' development and level of knowledge so that students of the 7th grade are easy to understand the materials in textbook. It is in line with the result of the interview with students, they argued that they like learning English using the textbook because it is easy to understand.

The last is graph suitability or anatomy components of a book. For this category, the result of evaluation found that organizing the textbook concluding part or closing part required further attention. Both of the textbook 1 and textbook 2 respectively obtained a percentage score of 60% (neutral) and 78.7% (appropriate).

In addition, based on the teacher interview related to the appropriateness of the English textbook used at MTs. Barana and after conducting the evaluation of English textbooks, the teacher taught that the textbook 2 (English for Nusantara) is more suitable with the students at this time than the textbook 1 (When English Rings a Bell).

"actually, what is more specific and can be followed for now is, referring to the difference between these two books, namely textbook 2 "English for Nusantara" (Merdeka curriculum) and textbook 1 "When English Rings a Bell" (K13 curriculum). Therefore, for now it is better to use Merdeka curriculum book (textbook 2) because it is more specifically focused on the division of English language skills or sections in each chapter. Meanwhile, the 2013 curriculum (textbook 1) only focuses on mastering the material in general, there are not divisions and specific assignments of each skill." (English teacher, February 2nd, 2024).

In other words, there are no special assignments between listening assignments, reading assignments, speaking assignments, and all of this are really directed at textbook 2. For textbook 1, the emphasis is still more general so students who use this book must be directed by the teacher. Because the material is a mixture of these four skills. So that there is not detail separation between listening, speaking, writing and reading skills section.

The implication of the evaluations results of the two English textbooks for the 7th grade students' is the need to focus on learning material, especially textbook 1. Aside from that, it is also need to pay attention to the organizing the closing parts of the textbook 1 because it does not really achieve the standard criteria of a good textbook. Additionally, in the term of learning material, the improvement step that can be taken including adding some materials related to students' needs, as the result of the students' needs interview, they need more study about vocabulary, how to pronounce the words as well as how to read well, and based on the evaluation result of textbook 1, it receives low percentage in the teaching and learning context. That is part of content suitability. Therefore, it is important to adding a list of vocabulary and teach how to pronounce the words as well as providing phonetical symbol in materials. Therefore, this improvement step is expected to improve students' English learning experience at the 7th grade of junior high school level.

CONCLUSION

Based on the findings and discussions, the researcher draws some conclusions as follows, the suitability of English textbooks developed by the ministry of education and culture of Indonesia for the 7th grade students at MTs. Barana receive a percentage score that meets the criteria of a good textbook for almost all aspects and one aspect that is still in neutral category which means that it still needs an improvement. For textbook 1 'When English Rings a Bell' that is used at MTs. Barana, almost all categories accept high score in graph suitability. In the aspect of graph suitability is in neutral with a percentage score of 60%. Whereas for textbook 2 'English for Nusantara' it is suit in all aspect of a good textbook. However, in the term of students' needs, the textbook 1 is not yet suitable with students' needs. While textbook 2 is suitable with students' needs.

REFERENCES

- Afiah, N. A., Atmowardoyo, H., & Sakkir, G. (2022). THE USE OF SOCIAL MEDIA IN LEARNING ENGLISH VOYABULARY. *PERFORMANCE: Journal of English Education and Literature*, 1(1).
- Alhamami, M. & Ahmad, J. (2018). EFL teachers attitudes toward commercial textbooks in EFL programs. *Arab World English Journal*, 9(4), 69-87.
- Atmowardoyo, H., Weda, S., & Sakkir, G. (2021, March). Learning Strategies in English Writing used by Good Language Learners in Millennial Era: A Positive Case Study in Universitas Negeri Makassar. In *PROCEEDING BOOK THE LANGUAGE TEACHER TRAINING AND EDUCATION INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE* (Vol. 1, No. 1, pp. 187-196). Program Magister Pendidikan bahasa Inggris Fakultas keguruan dan ilmu pendidikan Universitas Sebelas Maret.
- Atmowardoyo, H., Weda, S., & Sakkir, G. (2021). Learning Strategies in English Skills used by Good Language Learners in Millennial Era: A Positive Case Study in Universitas Negeri Makassar. *ELT Worldwide*, 8(1), 28-40.
- Cunningsworth, A. (1995). *Choosing your course book*. Oxford: Heinemann. p.5-7.
- Dollah, S., Sehuddin, M., & Sakkir, G. (2021). Motivating EFL Learners to Write Using Padlet Application. *ELT Worldwide*, 8(2), 240-254.
- Kasmawati, K. U., & Sakkir, G. U. (2020). IMPROVING STUDENTS READING COMPREHENSION THROUGH SURVEY, QUESTION, READING, RECITE, REVIEW (SQ3R) STRATEGY.
- MISNAWATI, M., Sakkir, G., Puspita, N., Akbar, Z., & Yusriadi, Y. (2021). Student learning interest in COVID-19 pandemic age by blended e-learning (Asynchronous and synchronous). In *Proceedings of the 11th Annual International Conference on Industrial Engineering and Operations Management* (pp. 6330-6339). IEOM Society International.
- Morales, L. C. C., Urrego, L. Y. O., Rodriguez, A. M. Q., & Gonzales, P. A. R. (2010). *English curriculum proposal based on a needs analysis study of efl learners in elementary grades at escuela normal superior distrital Maria Montessorri*. La Salle University, School of Education B. A. in Spanish, English and French.
- Muzakky, M., & Albiansyah, A. (2021). EFL teachers' perception toward the use of "beyond" international textbook. *Language Circle: Journal of Language and Literature*, 15(2), 177-182.
- Ratmanida & Suryanti, Y. (2020). An analysis of speaking materials in English textbook for the tenth grade of senior high school. *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research*, 463, 90.
- Richards, J. C. (2001). *Curriculum development in language teaching*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Saputra, U. R., Maulina, M., Nasrullah, R., & Sakkir, G. (2021). Students' Sentence Errors on WhatsApp Daily Status: A Literature Review. *Celebes Journal of Language Studies*, 23-31.
- Sihmirmo, P. (2015). The needs analysis of English learning for the fourth and fifth graders. *Eduscience*, 1(1), 42.
- Sudding, F. H., Dollah, S., & Sakkir, G. (2021, March). Teachers' Nonverbal Immediacy in English Language Learning. In *Proceeding book the language teacher training and education international conference* (Vol. 1, No. 1, pp. 197-217). PROGRAM MAGISTER PENDIDIKAN BAHASA INGGRIS FAKULTAS KEGURUAN DAN ILMU PENDIDIKAN UNIVERSITAS SEBELAS MARET.
- Tomlinson, B. (2012). Materials Development for Language Learning and Teaching. *Language Teaching*, 45, 143.